

Imagining Afghanistan

Over time and across different genres, Afghanistan has been presented to the world as potential ally, dangerous enemy, gendered space and mysterious locale. These powerful, if competing, visions seek to make sense of Afghanistan and to render it legible. In this innovative examination, Nivi Manchanda uncovers and critically explores Anglophone practices of knowledge cultivation and representational strategies and argues that Afghanistan occupies a distinctive place in the imperial imagination: over-determined and under-theorised, owing largely to the particular history of imperial intervention in the region. Focusing on representations of gender, state and tribes, Manchanda re-historicises and de-mythologises the study of Afghanistan through a sustained critique of colonial forms of knowing and demonstrates how the development of pervasive tropes in Western conceptions of Afghanistan have enabled Western intervention, invasion and bombing in the region from the nineteenth century to the present.

NIVI MANCHANDA is Senior Lecturer in International Politics at Queen Mary University of London. Her research interests include post-colonial theory, histories of race and empire, and gender studies. She is co-editor of *Race and Racism in International Relations: Confronting the Global Colour Line* (2014) and currently serves as editor-in-chief of the journal *Politics*.

Imagining Afghanistan

The History and Politics of Imperial Knowledge

Nivi Manchanda

Queen Mary University of London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-81176-7 – Imagining Afghanistan
Nivi Manchanda
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108811767

DOI: 10.1017/9781108867986

© Nivi Manchanda 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2020
First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Manchanda, Nivi, 1988– author.

Title: *Imagining Afghanistan : the history and politics of imperial knowledge* / Nivi Manchanda.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019055988 (print) | LCCN 2019055989 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108491235 (hardcover) | ISBN 9781108811767 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108867986 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Afghanistan–Study and teaching–Great Britain. | Afghanistan–Study and teaching–United States. | Afghanistan–Foreign public opinion, British. | Afghanistan–Foreign public opinion, American. | Knowledge, Theory of–Political aspects–Great Britain–History. | Knowledge, Theory of–Political aspects–United States–History. | Public opinion–Great Britain | Public opinion–United States. | Imperialism.

Classification: LCC DS355.2 .M36 2020 (print) | LCC DS355.2 (ebook) | DDC 958.1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019055988>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019055989>

ISBN 978-1-108-49123-5 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-81176-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For nana, and in loving memory of nani

But last year stories began to reach us from the capital of unrest among the barbarians. Traders travelling safe routes had been attacked and plundered. Stock thefts had increased in scale and audacity. A party of census officials had disappeared and been found buried in shallow graves. Shots had been fired at a provincial governor during a tour of inspection. There had been clashes with border patrols. The barbarian tribes were arming, the rumour went; the Empire should take precautionary measures, for there would certainly be war.

Of this unrest I myself saw nothing. In private I observed that once in every generation, without fail, there is an episode of hysteria about the barbarians. There is no woman living along the Frontier who has not dreamed of a dark barbarian hand coming from under the bed to grip her ankle, no man who has not frightened himself with visions of the barbarians carousing in his home, breaking the plates, setting fire to the curtains, raping his daughters. These dreams are the consequence of too much ease. Show me a barbarian army and I will believe.

—‘The Magistrate’ in J. M. Coetzee, *Waiting for Barbarians*, 1980

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1 The Construction of Afghanistan as a ‘Discursive Regime’	23
2 A Space Contested, or the ‘State’ of Afghanistan	66
3 The Emergency Episteme of the ‘Tribe’ in Afghanistan	105
4 Framed: Portrayals of Afghan Women in the Popular Imaginary	143
5 Subversive Identities: Afghan Masculinities as Societal Threat	180
Coda	221
<i>References</i>	230
<i>Index</i>	249

Figures

I.1 Afghan textbook from the Soviet era	<i>page 2</i>
1.1 Lady Butler, <i>Remnants of an Army</i>	29
1.2 Ambush in the Second Anglo-Afghan War	31
1.3 Afghanistan: graveyard of empires	38
2.1 Mountstuart Elphinstone's map of Afghanistan	79
2.2 Afghan Boundary Commission	81
2.3 'Whose to pay for the division of Afghanistan?'	83
2.4 'Af-Pak' 2025: a geography of terror	98
4.1 'Terror attack level: Severe – an attack is highly likely. For security reasons it is now time to ban the burka.'	153
4.2 Woman in a <i>burqa</i>	163
C.1 Really Big Coloring Books: Talibani 5	222

Acknowledgements

In an interview Fred Moten once intimated that if we think something (a piece of music, a painting, a text) belongs to an individual, it is probably because we didn't look closely enough. One need not read between the lines to realise that this book too is a product of what academics increasingly label 'co-production'. It emerges out of an industry renowned for its practices of appropriation, expropriation, silencing and discrediting, and as such it is implicated in those invariably racialised, gendered and classed processes of knowledge production. But it is also a product of intellectual community, political solidarity and enduring friendships.

In the past ten years I have amassed innumerable debts: from the early days of my PhD, I had the active and invaluable support of Duncan Bell and Tarak Barkawi at the University of Cambridge. In London, many brilliant generations of PhD students based at the LSE read drafts, shared insights and drinks and made an indelible impact on the project. I am lucky to be able to call Charmaine Chua, Ali Howell, Kerem Nisançioğlu, Olivia Rutazibwa, Jesse Crane-Seeber, Paul Kirby, Michael Bloomfield, Kathryn Fisher, Melanie Richter-Montpetit, Rahul Rao, Akanksha Mehta, Ida Roland Birkvad, Kelly-Jo Bluen and Kate Millar my friends, and their influence can be felt palpably on the pages of *Imagining Afghanistan*. Martin Bayly, Jonathan Ludvig and Kurt Jacobsen read the manuscript in full, and the book is a much stronger piece of scholarship for it. I owe special thanks to James Eastwood and Chris Rossdale for their close reading of countless drafts, hours of conversation and general ability to discuss the minutiae of this project from its inception to its 'completion'. Words will not do justice to how much I have learned from them over the years, and how much I value their friendship. Lisa Tilley and Sara Salem have been sources of untold wisdom, wit and warmth, and their confidence in this project was often infectious enough for me to overcome my own lingering doubts about it. They have shaped my thinking profoundly, and I hope this book is worthy of their faith in me. There are far more people – some of them close friends, others whose brilliance I've only encountered fleetingly at conferences – who have had some input on *Imagining Afghanistan*

x Acknowledgements

than I can thank in this space. I hope they will forgive me for their absence, which is only an absence on paper.

At Queen Mary University of London (QMUL), I have experienced that rare coalescence of camaraderie and intellectual generosity that has led me, on more than one occasion, to confuse ‘work’ with ‘home’. I am indebted to each one of my current and former colleagues, but I’d have to single out Robbie Shilliam, Engin Isin, Kim Hutchings, Laleh Khalili, Sophie Harman, Clive Gabay, Holly Ryan, Liz Chatterjee, Musab Younis and Peter Brett as pillars of support and inspiration. Sharri Plonski and Kate Hall have been so much more than colleagues, and their presence in my life in the final stages of writing and editing has made the whole process bearable, even enjoyable. At QMUL and beyond, I have had the honour of teaching excellent students who have pushed me to be clearer and more coherent in my writing and thinking.

Danny Hayward’s and Zayed El Omari’s assistance has been indispensable at various points in this project. I am also grateful to all those who have helped me chase copyrights, navigate archives and library collections and directed me to the right ‘sources’.

My final thanks are reserved for my family, who have ensured that despite many a political disagreement, I have not had to lose my kin. My gratitude for my parents is perhaps overshadowed only by my love for them, even though I must confess that I fail to express either adequately. Seeing how much they have sacrificed has definitively discouraged me from having children of my own. Masi, Markus, Tarini and Kabir are some of my best friends and favourite people. That they also happen to be my immediate family is a stroke of luck unparalleled in any fable of good fortune. Harriet Maltby, John McCambridge, Anna Berezovskaja and Zaya Bulag have been my family of choice, and have graciously endured all that I’ve subjected them to over the last decade. Paul Higate has joked that he is the secret co-author of this book, and as with so many jokes of that ilk, there is more than a grain of truth in it. Admittedly, in this, as in many other walks of my life, he is a silent co-author. Nonetheless, as a true feminist, he can rest assured in the knowledge that for once it is the man who’s being thanked for his assistance in typing, doing the dishes and generally ensuring the writer’s sanity. All this to say, that I love him with all my heart and he brings me more happiness than I deserve.

This book is dedicated to nana, who impels me to be a better person and scholar each day, and to the memory of nani, without whom the book, and much of who I am and what I do, would be unrecognisable.

The editors at Cambridge University Press, and Lucy Rhymer in particular, saw merit in this project many years ago and have adeptly shepherded it into its current form. Emily Sharp has been a pleasure to work with, expertly fielding

Acknowledgements

xi

my million bewildered questions. Lisa Carter and Fiona Little, likewise, have worked tirelessly in the final stages of production. A section of Chapter 1 has been published in *Middle East Critique* (<https://doi.org/10.1080/19436149.2019.1633745>), and some of Chapter 5 has been adapted from an argument I made in *Third World Quarterly*. While I cannot take the full blame for the structural elisions and erasures that I am (largely) unwittingly implicated in, most mistakes and omissions remain mine.